Money on the Silk Road: Debt, Gifts and Bribes
Rune Steenberg Reyhê

Motivation
Dealing with money matters takes up a large part of our lives and money enters into our conversations and thoughts on a daily basis. Yet, unlike another similarly big driver of our society’s imagination, love, we rarely take time to think about what money actually is, means and what function it fulfills in our lives. Is money a thing? Is it material? Is it virtual? Is it a measure of worth? Of objects? Of people? Is it credit or debt? Is it a unit for accounting? What does it count? How is money created? Does money have a creating force? If so, what does it create? What is its relation to trust, to authority, to violence? What is its relation to work? To happiness? Even more rarely yet do we consider how its meaning and content changes over time and how it varies in a cross-cultural perspective. The cross-cultural aspect of a reflection on money has become increasingly necessary, as money today, unlike all other things, and especially unlike people, travels the world almost unrestrictedly by space and borders and largely uncontrolled at the speed of light. Niklas Luhmann, like many sociologists after Talcott Parsons, sees money as a medium in the system we call economy. But as Marilyn Strathern, Keith Hart and other anthropologists amply show, the relation of the so called economy to other areas of life like kinship, politics and culture varies widely across social contexts in time and space and hardly anywhere is there any clear and impenetrable division between money, relations, morality and power in practice.
In this course we will approach money and monetisation from an anthropological perspective in the geographical and historical frame of social contexts in Central Asia, China and Russia roughly within the last 120 years. This entails at least three large transformations each of which has been instrumental in changing the meaning and use of money. The first was the transformation from colonising empires (Russian Empire and the Qing Dynasty) to modernising republics. The second was the introduction of collectivisation and a command economy under communism. The third was the evolution into capitalist market economies starting in the 1980s and accelerating in the decades that followed. During such transformations, not only the meaning and use of money changes. Money is and has been instrumental in effecting large scale social changes as well. We will look at these changes across and beyond Central Asia.

Bulletin Description
This course explores the varying meanings of money and the social practices related to it as well as the consequences of monetisation and financialisation, primarily in what is today Post-Soviet and Chinese Central Asia, from an anthropological perspective. Starting out from the theoretical fundament of gift exchange theory and economic anthropology we venture into anthropological debates on money, debt, value, finance, and development. Focus will be on contemporary Central Asia, but the historical developments and surrounding societies will also be comparatively dealt with in some detail.

Course Description
Monetisation, the rising importance of money and its penetration into increasing parts of daily life of people all over the world, has been an integrated part of the-proliferation of the nation state and capitalist market economy. These phenomena impact not only macro scale economies, but have the potential of altering the social fabric of a community or a city to a very high degree. This has become particularly visible within the frame of the economic and political changes experienced by the people of Post-Soviet countries and China in the past decades. Starting with modernizing societies without a market economy, in the reform periods of Deng Xiaoping on the Chinese side and Gorbachev on the Soviet side, changes were gradually introduced, culminating in the breakdown of the Soviet Union in 1991, the implementation of IMF “shock therapy”-measures and
the state led transformation of China into a WTO member and an economic super power on the capitalist world market. These events have increased the availability and necessity of money to people living in Central Asia and this has contributed to changing social structures and institutions of both exchange, kinship, politics and the livelihoods of people. Important structures of gift exchange and the social networks they constitute are being altered. How do local social institutions transform in an environment of monetisation? What is deemed corruption, by whom and on which premises? When is a gift a present and when an obligation? Who wins and loses on the new Silk Road across Central Eurasia?

Our ethnographic journey takes us across wide steppes, across the desert from oasis to oasis, down the sparkling asphalt of the New Silk Road and its dusty roadside ditches, to container bazaars for cheap clothes and between urban commercial centres and remote mountain villages, while our theoretical journey stretches from the gift exchange theory of Marcel Mauss, Karl Polanyi’s embeddedness, Marshall Sahlin’s reciprocity all the way to theories of money, debt, credit and value by Keith Hart, Chris Gregory and David Graeber.

This course places theory at the center of the learning endeavor. A main focus will be on the theoretical concepts of economic anthropology (gift exchange theory, the anthropology of money and the anthropology of value more generally) and how to apply them analytically. The cases and examples from Central Asia, China and Russia in the texts and provided by me, serve as material to test-drive the these concepts and their theoretical frameworks. The course will furthermore provide ample insights into the process of economic and social transformation and the social effects of monetarisation and the rise of capitalism in Central Asia and beyond. Knowledge of the regions is helpful but not necessary.

Requirements
1) Active participation in class discussions and reading of the texts, which are subdivided roughly into theoretical texts and case study or example texts. Each type of text will have to be read differently and it is a methodological aim of the course for the students to experiment with reading techniques and develop their personal reading strategies. Critical reading and source criticism is encouraged and incorporated into the analysis of the texts read. This prominently includes making explicit the implicit models and presuppositions of the texts. Regarding content, the texts cover three categories: General texts on Central Asia which provide the context, theoretical texts which provide the analytical tools needed, and texts presenting case studies or a regionally focussed specific topic. The latter texts will be our main material for analysis and discussion while the second category provides us with analytical tools.
2) Weekly, three questions and comments on the readings and one thought on the connection of the topic to your own life are to be sent to me one day in advance of the session. When reading the theoretical texts, I want you to write out the key concepts developed, used, presented or criticised in the text, define them and relate them to each other. We will collect and edit them on Courseworks as an experimental form of own theory generation.
3) Each student is required to choose one country or region which s/he will research and present on in class. The student will maintain a focus on that region for the rest of the course including staying up-to-date on recent political events and social developments, especially via online media, blogs and fora. As the students venture to choose an area or region in Central Asia, they will soon discover, that the way our media and academic categories work and the way available information is ordered and scaled online and elsewhere, makes it almost impossible not to choose states, large state administrative units (such as autonomous regions) or state-designated ethnic categories as our point of departure. This insight is a part of the learning.
4) Towards the end of the semester, one short essay on a topic connected to the seminar is to be handed in. The topic must be checked with me in a personal conversation in advance.

Grading
Syllabus

1 Course Introduction
After a round of introduction follows a presentation of the content of the course, the key analytical concepts and theoretical debates we will cover and the area of Central Eurasia plus Russia and China. I will give a short talk on Economic Anthropology, the Anthropology of Money and the Bourdieuan forms of capital as a starting point for discussion after which we will go through the reading list.

Course readings

2 Money
As something we use every day and a concept that increasingly catches the attention of public discourse, money and its use shall be reflected upon from an anthropological perspective. Some of money’s special characteristics, such as its fungability and its close ties to trust, authority and power shall be discussed and our own conceptualisations of money and its meaning critically assessed. We will here start to develop some of the analytical tools and lenses we will use to approach the case studies and texts to follow. Our first ethnographic case is from South Kyrgyzstan.

Course readings

Further suggested readings
3 Gift Giving
In Central Asia, money is not merely a vehicle for commodity acquisition. It is also one of the most important objects of gift exchange, the central means for establishing social networks and for constituting kinship and community. The obligation to give, receive and reciprocate has been a central pillar of social order and structure in many non-state, non-market societies around the world throughout history. Such structures are still very much of relevance in Central Asia, despite them being interrelated with stronger or weaker state institutions and market economics.

Course readings

Further suggested readings

4 Kinship and Economy. Networks and Communities.
Thomas Piketty has recently once more demonstrated patterns of inheritance and thus kinship to be of central significance to the world economy and to the inequality within it. Similar economic significance must be attributed marriage and the transfers of wealth it includes in Central Asia, entailing dowry, bride wealth, bride price, mehr (the Morning Gift, given to the bride as security in case of a future divorce) and the conspicuous consumption of life cycle celebrations including increasingly exorbitant wedding. Gift giving, generosity and hospitality transforms into precious social capital at these events and must kept in balance in relation to the ever more important economic capital within the couple, household and family. As the economic units shift, so does the conceptualisation of relatedness.

Course readings
Further suggested readings
- Firth, Raymond, and Basil S. Yamey (eds) (2004/1964): Capital, saving and credit in peasant societies: Studies from Asia, Oceania, the Caribbean and Middle America. Routledge, London.

5 Altruism and the Interested Gift
Gifts are not presents. “As friends make gifts, so gifts make friends”, but depending on the socio-cultural context, the relation between giver and receiver and the type of gift they may also create dependencies, debts and clients: “As sticks make dogs, so gifts make slaves”. On the morning of his daughter’s wedding, as Sicilian tradition has it, Vito Corleone cannot decline any request. He indeed does not. But, “one day I might ask a little favor of you in return”. The debate on whether gifts are instrumental or altruistic and under which circumstances gains in complexity and interest when we add the question of what the goal is, i.e. the question of the hierarchy of values, of what is means and what is ends.

Course readings
- Strathern, Marilyn (1992): "Qualified Value: The Perspective of Gift Exchange", in Steven Hugh-Jones and Caroline Humphrey (eds), Barter, Exchange and Value: An Anthropological Approach,

Further suggested readings

6 The Origins of Money
Are “primitive money” the origin of modern money? Or is the practice of barter? Or maybe credit? Or debt? We will look at and compare several theories about the origin of money and discuss what each implies and shows about the use of money today, both in our own daily lives and in the social contexts of Central Asia. We will also venture further into the connections between money, the state, the military, debt, banks and power.

Course readings

Further suggested readings

7 Gifts or Commodities and social Embeddedness — Guest Steffen Riemer (INTERACT, Weatherhead Institute)
What distinguishes a gift from a commodity and can one change into the other? In the classical commodity economy, according to Polanyi, the economy is disembedded from society and morality, while a gift economy is completely embedded and the objects transferred carry an inalienable part
of the giver. The familiarity of gift giving and the anonymity of commodity exchange do not always fit the more complex realities of economic life. Yet, as models they are convenient tools to think with and beyond, which we will do in this session at the example of the Opium War and the role of Indian capital in it, which INTERACT post-doc at the Weatherhead Institute, Steffen Riemer, will give a presentation on in class. In the following discussion we will use the concepts of “gift”, “commodity” and “embeddedness” to analyse the historical setting presented by Steffen Riemer.

Course readings

Further suggested readings

8 Economies of Favors in Socialist Societies:
Any formal or official economy will create a space for a certain degree of informality: a second economy, a shadow economy, a black market. This is no inherent quality of the so defined exchanges but rather an effect of a system of rules and often state laws drawing up a border that creates such two categories. Thus the kind of second economy developing to a high degree depends on the kind of legal system defining the space for it. The socialist countries featuring a longstanding command economy, developed a certain kind of “shadow economy” including what has been called an “economy of favors”. This “economy”, based on personalistic ties, connections and social relations (blat), has much in common with the Chinese art of relationships (guanxixue) which likewise developed or transformed during the communist time. Both of these systems have historical, cultural and logical-systemic connections to the kinds of gift giving networks we have discussed earlier. We will explore both the similarities and differences.

Course readings
Money and Networks in Post-Socialist Societies:

As economic reforms were implemented in both the People’s Republic of China and the Soviet Union, the second economies and the close connection between social relations and economic undertakings transformed. Money became an increasingly necessary resource and thus closely tied to relations and access to resources. In much of Post-Soviet Central Asia money became a scarce resource during the economic downturn following the collapse of the Soviet Union. This new significance of money and its close ties to social relations contributed to transforming many social institutions.

Course readings
- Polese, Abel P (2008): “If I receive it, it is a gift; if I demand it, then it is a bribe”: On the Local Meaning of Economic Transactions in Post-Soviet Ukraine.” Anthropology in Action 15 (3): 47–60.
Further suggested readings

10 Monetisation and Transforming Social Institutions
We examine further examples of how monetisation can transform or even destroy a society and a closer look at the economic and social transformations and consequences of contemporary monetisation and marketisation in Central Asia.

Course readings


Further suggested readings


11 The New Silk Road

As the market economy developed in China and Central Asia, a revival of the centuries old border trade along the ancient Silk Road quickly ensued and became a source of both wealth and prestige among populations close to the borders. Especially the traditional trader populations, Uyghurs, Uzbeks and to some degree Kazakhs, became involved in the early trade across the newly re-opened Sino-Central Asian borders. In Kyrgyzstan and Kazakhstan huge transfer markets consisting of shipping containers in several vertical layers appeared for the cheap Chinese produced commodities transferring to Uzbekistan and Russia. The flows and tides of the border trade have changed according to the political situations and regulations since. New populations have become involved, such as the Kyrgyz and in lately large Chinese enterprises with government support conquer the markets along Chinese built infrastructure, further enlivened by Xi Jinping’s newly proclaimed econ-political initiatives of the “New Silk Road” and “One Belt one Road”.

Course readings

Further suggested readings
12 Money and Morality

Money counts value, but it is also itself a value-idea, a concept within society. Socio-cultural ideologies judge money in a certain way, making it the source of bliss and happiness or of all evil. Within ideologies and cosmologies, money acquires a certain, renegotiable relation to other social values and moral rules are drawn up for its acquisition and usage. Christian and Muslim debates on usury give ample insight into such processes. So does the way trade was looked down upon in much of Kyrgyzstan well into the 2000s and the rise of Islamic Finance and Banking in Central Asia. All are questions of the kind and extent of the social and moral embeddedness of money.

Course readings

Further suggested readings
13 Finance and Financialisation
Finance is becoming increasingly central in the world economy, taking up an ever larger portion of the GDP and of profits made in many developed countries. According to economists, this switch from the producing sector to the financial sector, called financialisation, is not limited to banks venturing deeper into speculative markets, but penetrates the entire economy and even society of late capitalism. Companies become involved in their own financing schemes and both private investors and lay people engage in stock market and valuta speculation while taking credits and mortgage in banks. In China the stock market is especially saturated with private investors with little technical knowledge of the processes, running high risks. This became clear when the market plummeted in summer 2015. Here another special feature of the Chinese financial market likewise showed: Its close tie to politics and the party’s continuing will and capability to control it. In Central Asia especially Xinjiang is subject to this state led financialisation of the heavily subsidised economy, but the effects are felt across the region.

Course readings

Further suggested readings
- El Qorchi, Mohammed (2005): "Islamic finance gears up." Finance and Development 42 (4) 46-54.

14 Beyond Money. Theories of Value
In this last session we will explore the relation between money and other values more deeply. For this we will reconsider concepts discussed earlier in the semester, such as “social capital”, “debt”, “gift”, “human economies” and “a barter model of value”, to define them within a broader theory of value and in relation to socio-cultural value hierarchies. We will further treat some of the economic
metaphors used in daily life and the centrality of money and economy to our thinking.


Further suggested readings